

In the matter of
Maroondah Planning Scheme Amendment C116: Jubilee Park

Planning Panels Victoria

Proponent:
Maroondah City Council

Expert Witness Statement of:
Claire Scott



1. Name and address

Claire Scott

Claire Scott Planning, 163 Station Street, Port Melbourne, Victoria, 3207.

m. 0427 700 295 | claire.scott@me.com

2. Qualifications & experience

I hold the degrees of Bachelor of Environmental Design (1993), and Master of Town Planning (1996) from the University of Tasmania.

I have over 20 years experience working in statutory and strategic planning, and urban design, both in local government and consulting. I am a former Director at Planisphere Planning & Urban Design, and established my own company, Claire Scott Planning, in 2016.

I specialise in urban and residential character, and landscape assessment studies, and have been the recipient of State and National awards in this field.

My experience also includes the preparation of urban design frameworks, structure plans, and built form guidelines, and the implementation of such studies through the formulation of planning scheme policy and controls, and amendment documentation. I have also worked on projects covering the fields of Aboriginal and post-contact heritage, viewshed analysis and open space planning, in both urban and rural environments.

I am the former Chair of the Melbourne University Master of Urban Design Advisory Board, and a former Committee Member of the Heritage Council of Victoria Landscape Advisory Committee.

My curriculum vitae is included in **Annexure A**.

3. Scope & involvement

Process

I was first engaged as a sub-consultant by Context Pty Ltd in September 2016 to undertake a preliminary analysis of the neighbourhood character of Jubilee Park, as an input to the Jubilee Park Heritage and Neighbourhood Character Scoping Study, which had been commissioned by the Maroondah City Council.

Following the completion of the *Jubilee Park Heritage and Neighbourhood Character Scoping Report* (March 2017), I was once again engaged as a sub-consultant by Context Pty Ltd in June 2017 to undertake Stage 2 of the work, comprising a more detailed neighbourhood character assessment and final recommendations.

I completed my neighbourhood character assessment of Jubilee Park and included my recommendations in a final report, *Jubilee Park Stage 2: Neighbourhood Character*, dated February 2018.

The key findings of my report were incorporated into the *Jubilee Park Heritage and Neighbourhood Character Study* (February 2018), prepared by Context Pty Ltd, and my neighbourhood character report was also included in full as Appendix C.

Also in February 2018, Maroondah City Council engaged me to prepare draft amendment documents pertaining to proposed Neighbourhood Residential Zone Schedule 5 and Neighbourhood Character Overlay Schedule 3.

Instructions

My written instructions to prepare this Expert Witness Statement are set out in **Annexure B**.

4. Summary of opinions

I adopt my report, *Jubilee Park Stage 2: Neighbourhood Character*, February 2018, as the basis of my Expert Witness Statement and evidence.

My report is included in **Annexure C**.

Modification to exhibited controls

I was advised in my instructions that having regard to the submissions received and expert advice, Council now proposes to modify the exhibited controls, as follows:

- Replace the proposed HO to the house at 18 James Street, Ringwood, with an NCO over the entire property.
- Replace the proposed HO to the properties at 8 – 24 Haig Street, Ringwood, with an NCO.
- Retain land at 28 & 30 Greenwood Avenue, and 62A Ford Street, Ringwood, in the GRZ.

I am supportive of the proposed modifications based on the following:

18 James Street, Ringwood, while architecturally altered, is a particularly characterful dwelling that contributes to, and forms a logical extension to, the proposed NCO.

18 James Street is a single storey, detached, timber Interwar home (Californian Bungalow), and displays all of the built form and siting characteristics of other dwellings in the street and the proposed NCO. It is set within a generous garden and behind a low timber picket fence. Its form is low scale and it comprises well-articulated building elements, including a generous timber porch, and a tiled, gabled roof.

Numbers 8 – 24 Haig Street, Ringwood, are located within a larger proposed HO area, and are set apart due to their era of construction being Post War, and later than the other dwellings in the street and proposed HO. While no longer considered appropriate for the HO area, their inclusion in the proposed NCO is well reasoned.

Numbers 8 – 24 Haig Street display the same neighbourhood character attributes of the wider proposed NCO area. They are consistent in materials (weatherboard with tiled roofs), setbacks and form, and are architecturally austere, as is typical of this period. The dwellings are set in generous, well-established gardens, behind low fences, and express the modest, simple and traditional neighbourhood characteristics of Haig Street generally, as well as the wider precinct.

The application of the NCO to numbers 8 – 24 Haig Street is also important to support the application of the HO on properties opposite and adjacent. Any development proposed on these sites has the potential to impact on the significance of the heritage sites, and the wider streetscape and precinct generally.

As a result of this proposed modification to exhibited controls, and the inclusion of additional properties in the proposed NCO, the proposed schedule (NCO3) has been updated in relation to clause 1.0 statement of neighbourhood character.

The amended schedule (with track changes) is included in **Annexure D**.

Numbers 28 and 30 Greenwood Avenue have been developed at the rear with small brick villa units. There are two units to the rear of no. 28 and one unit to the rear of no. 30.

In both cases, the original 1950s weatherboard dwellings have been retained at the front of the sites, remnants of the era of the original subdivision and in keeping with the character of the wider Jubilee Park precinct. However, it is accepted that the remainder of Greenwood Avenue to the north has been redeveloped, almost without exception, with three and four multi-unit developments. The eastern side of Greenwood Avenue is also occupied by Greenwood Park and an adjacent kindergarten, resulting in an open, 'non-traditional' residential streetscape, differing from James, Kendall, Ellison and Haig Streets.

It is also accepted that the Greenwood Avenue sites containing the 1950s dwellings (and units to the rear), are physically and visually separated from the original Ringwood Primary School buildings by a garden area supporting substantial vegetation, and car parking. As such, the Greenwood Avenue sites exist in 'isolation' and are somewhat removed from the wider heritage and neighbourhood character precinct.

On balance, it is considered reasonable that the GRZ be retained on these properties. Any future development will be required to have regard for the neighbourhood character objectives in the schedule (proposed GRZ1), and other variations to Clauses 54 and 55 (recommended as part of the overall Neighbourhood Character Study Review).

Number 62A Ford Street, Ringwood, comprises a relatively contemporary low scale brick and tile dwelling on a small lot, which has been subdivided from the rear of 9 Emerald Street. This property was included as part of 9 Emerald Street, but in fact has no relationship to the neighbourhood character of Emerald Street.

5. Additional work

Following the completion of the Jubilee Park Heritage and Neighbourhood Character Study in February 2018, I was engaged to undertake the Maroondah Neighbourhood Character Study Review (NCS Review). This project is complete, pending Council's review of feedback from DELWP and Maroondah City Council adoption (expected September 2019).

The NCS Review comprises a full neighbourhood and landscape character assessment of all residential areas in Maroondah, including an audit of existing Neighbourhood Areas (as determined by the former Neighbourhood Character Study, prepared by Planisphere in 2003).

This further assessment, including additional work on the landscape and residential character of Jubilee Park, reinforces and supports my initial character conclusions and recommendations.

The NCS Review also recommends further inclusions to proposed Schedule 5 to the Neighbourhood Residential Zone, which do not form part of this amendment (but will be proposed as part of a future amendment to implement the findings of the NCS Review), namely variations to the requirements of Clauses 54 and 55 (permeability 30%, and landscaping requirements), and application requirements (a landscape plan).

I adopt my final draft reports, *Maroondah Neighbourhood Character Study Review, Volume 1: Residential Character Assessment*, July 2019, and *Maroondah Neighbourhood Character Study Review, Volume 2: Residential Character Recommendations*, July 2019, as further evidence.

The reports are included in **Annexure E**.

6. Response to submissions

Seventy one (71) submissions were received to the proposed amendment. Of these, 49 were objections and 22 were in support.

I have reviewed the submissions to Amendment C116 pertaining to neighbourhood character matters, and **Annexure F** contains my response.

7. Declaration

I have made all the inquiries that I believe are desirable and appropriate and no matters of significance, which I regard as relevant, have to my knowledge been withheld from the Panel.



Claire Scott

Director, Claire Scott Planning

8 August 2019

Annexure A

Claire Scott Curriculum Vitae

Annexure B

Written instructions

Annexure C

Jubilee Park Stage 2: Neighbourhood Character, February 2018

Annexure D

Amended Schedule 3 to the NCO

Annexure E

Maroondah Neighbourhood Character Study Review, Volume 1: Residential Character Assessment, July 2019

Maroondah Neighbourhood Character Study Review, Volume 2: Residential Character Recommendations, July 2019

Annexure F

Response to submissions